

Strategic Environment Plan for Palawan Act: 23 Years After

A review and assessment of the Law's Impact to Palawan's Development through
Focus Group Discussions with Key Stakeholders
March – April 2015



Report Prepared by:
James Paul S. Inawasan
Consultant

Support Documentors

Jenevieve P. Hara
Cherry Lyn S. Jalover

Marianne Faith M. Perez
Luigi Lubrico





Palawan Council for Sustainable Development
Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

SEP Law: Its Impacts to Palawan, Its Environment, People and Development

A review and assessment of the Law through Focus Group Discussions with Key Stakeholders
March – April 2015

SUMMARY OF FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS

GAINS, POSITIVE		FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academ e, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “The law is noble.” • “The objective of the law is good.” • “The concept, framework and plan is good.” • “<i>Marami s’yang mga magandang nagawa sa Palawan.</i>” • “<i>Maraming natulong ang batas...maganda yung batas kung nasusunod talaga s’ya...posibleng kung walang SEP law baka ang bundok natin ay butas-butabas na...</i>” 	√	√	√	
2	<p>Sense of pride among Palaweños.</p> <p>Environmental awareness/consciousness among LGUs, the people, and even investors.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Even investors [are now aware and help] protect marine resources <i>kasi iyon ang</i> main source of their activities in the area. They are now helping in the protection of the environment.” 	√			
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “SEP law triggered the consciousness of people in environmental awareness.” 	√			
4	<p>Protection of the environment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PCSD is synonymous with “protection of the environment”. • PCSD regulates live fish, chases and files cases against those illegally cutting trees, committing other illegal activities. • “SEP [guides the people] in protecting the environment.” • “<i>Maganda ang nagawa nito</i> when it comes to environmental protection <i>kasi</i> every LGU 	√	√		√



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

	<p>ay nagkaroon ng guidelines in every municipality.”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Noong 1980s wala pang SEP law ay napakalakas ng kaingin dito... but noong nagkaroon ng SEP, unti-unting nabawasan, malaking bagay na din kasi nagkaroon sila ng takot, dahil noon parang walang takot yung mga ilegalista.” • “Without SEP Law, kalbo na ang bundok, wala na ding isda...” • “Sa protected area management maganda ang outcome ng SEP dahil sa pagkakaroon ng complementation on the implementation of PA management.” 				
	GAINS, POSITIVE (continuation)	FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academe, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
5	<p>Rehabilitation of marine resources.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “About sa fishing, iyong mga isda ay lumalapit ulit, dahil dati malayo pa ang nararating ng mga fisherman, ngayon eh ‘di na sila masyadong lumalayo, sa tingin ko eh isa ito sa epekto ng mga efforts ng PCSD.” 		√		
6	<p>Law enforcement. Deterrent to illegal activities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PCSD’s fair and consistent application of the law effectively discourages illegal activities. “Binabalewala nila ang LGU, unlike PCSD na talagang kinatatakutan nila dahil maaari silang kasuhan.” • “Ang PCSD ay ‘di kayang takutin ng mga tao dahil hindi binoboto kaya nai-enforce ang dapat i-enforce.” • “Malaking tulong po ang PCSD[S] sa’min kasi doon sa mga lugar na may tao kami o kaya limited ang tao eh nagkakaroon po ang PCSD at BFAR ng tie-up in implementing of regulations.” • PCSD helps other enforcement agencies especially on the legal aspect of apprehending violators, filing cases and prosecuting suspects. • “Scarce ang bentahan [ng wildlife] dahil sa effective na law enforcement.” 	√		√	√
7	<p>Policy-direction/framework to LGUs, people.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “SEP is the one that serves as guide and create guidelines to Palawan people in protecting 	√	√		



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

	<p>the environment.”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Maganda ang nagawa nito when it comes to environmental protection kasi every LGU ay nagkaroon ng guidelines in every municipality.” “Maganda iyong framework [for governance].” 				
	GAINS, POSITIVE (continuation)	FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academ e, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
8	<p>ECAN Board.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Malaki ang nagagawa sa aming munisipyo ng ECAN Board dahil ang composition ay from LGU at guided naman kami.” “Maganda ang creation of ECAN Board dahil in the local level ay nagsama-sama ang mga iba’t-ibang agencies at napag-uusapan ang issues, in terms of the environment.” 		√		√
9	<p>ECANization.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “I think in terms of strategic plan with the land use, maganda po, ECAN is good.” 	√			√
10	<p>Partnership with other agencies.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Maganda ang presence ng PCSDS sa Multi-partite Monitoring Team...” “Malaking tulong po ang PCSD[S] sa’min kasi doon sa mga lugar na may tao kami o kaya limited ang tao e nagkakaroon po ang PCSD at BFAR ng tie-up in implementing of regulations.” 				√
11	<p>Implementation of the law is improving. “Now the PCSD involves everyone.”</p>	√			
12	<p>Technically-equipped staff, and continuing staff development mechanism in the organization.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Magagaling ang staff, well-equipped...” “May continuing staff development, sana mahawa ang DENR and other agencies.” 	√		√	
13	<p>Trust and Confidence on PCSD.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Binabalewala nila ang LGU, unlike PCSD na talagang kinatatakutan nila dahil maaari silang kasuhan.” “We trust PCSD, so we believe them.” 	√			



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

- “I am sure that PCSDS [is] really doing their job.”

ISSUES, AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT		FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academ e, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
1	<p>Information dissemination about the Law and the SEP Clearance/Permitting system.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Only the people at the LGU and those who have permit applications before the PCSD know about the law. • People are more familiar about the PCSD but not about the law. • People seem to only know PCSD and the SEP Law only when the latter invokes the law to apprehend those who violate it. • “[Communication] approach is high profile.” • “The primers are written in English.” • “<i>Kulang...malinaw dapat sa mga magpu-put up ng projects ang procedures at requirements. It’s the_PCSD’s responsibility that the contractors are not knowledgeable about PCSD requirements/SEP system.</i>” 	√		√	√
2	<p>Duplication of functions, conflicting policies among agencies.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Others are questioning if PCSD duplicates the power of DENR, BFAR and other agencies...” • “<i>May mga conflict din po na nangyayari...halimbawa may species na sa amin [BFAR] na ‘di pinagbabawal pero sa PCSD naman ay bawal.</i>” • “There is a need for agencies to level off and develop joint cooperation protocols.” • Duplicating requirements (documents and fees) with similar agencies. 	√			√
3	<p>Composition, Politicization and Decision-making of the PCSD Council.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “PCSD has become a venue of political biases, kaya <i>nawawala ang true essence [of the law].</i>” • “The law is very noble <i>pero</i> the people who are handling it can sometimes be considered as the problem.” • “<i>Umiiba ang direction [ng Council from the intent of the law].</i>” 	√		√	



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

- “The implementation of the law is sometimes selective.”
- “*Walang bola po magagaling ang staff, well-equipped pero pagdating sa Council parang nabubura po yun... dahil sa mga decisions. Specific example, the Macro Asia MPSA¹. It [took so long before we were able to decide and tell Macro Asia that it cannot work on a core zone, at may batas like NIPAS, bakit andaming taon na ang Macro Asia ay nag-i-exist pa rin, it is the very specific example na ‘di ma-desisyunan using the law.’*”

ISSUES, AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT (*continuation*)

FGD1:
LGU
(VML &
PCL)

FGD2:
LGU &
Military

FGD3:
Media,
Academ
e, NGOs

FGD4:
NGAs,
Police
&
Military

4 **‘Painstaking[ly] slow, confusing [permitting] process.’ Not investor-friendly, ‘burden to businesses’ and even government projects.**

- “*Sa development, painstaking talaga ang process. Hindi investor-friendly ang PCSD.*”
- “*Resort investors in Calamianes said na sobrang mahaba ang process ng pag-apply, that’s why they think na parusa iyon sa kanila...*”
- “*If wala ang SEP marami na ang mga hotel[s] and resorts.... Long processes [are] constraints.*”
- “*Matagal ang process because hindi nagko-convene lagi ang Council.*”
- “*The whole [project/business] process is all affected because of that, ang mga contractors meron silang hinahabol na schedule, kawawa naman sila dahil hindi pwede mag-start kapag wala pa silang permit from PCSD.*”
- The Bahile boat tram project (“US government-funded”) might be pulled out, “*dahil sa sobrang tagal ng process...sayang nga po ang project. Nag-decline ang contractor dahil matagal na hindi kami makakuha ng SEP clearance dahil sa nine mangrove trees na dapat putulin.*”
- **Duplication of requirements.** “*Kinuha na sa una, sa susunod [na office] kukunin ulit, nagiging paulit ulit po eh.*”
- Additional fees from PCSD (e.g. Local Transport Permit) vis-à-vis fees collected by similar agencies (BFAR).
- “*Marami ang process and requirements na nagiging pahirap sa mga [live fish] shippers.*”

√

√



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

ISSUES, AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT (<i>continuation</i>)		FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academ e, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
5	<p>The Clearance System ‘hinders environmental research.’</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Nagiging major constraint...ang permitting, dahil dito ay hindi makagawa ng taxonomic studies para maka-discover ng bagong species. • “Actually, sa permit, natatambay kami sa NCIPⁱⁱ, ‘di kami nakakarating sa inyo.” 			√	
6	<p>Allegedly PCSD’s research/monitoring of the province’s coral reefs is questionable.</p>	√			
7	<p>Enforcement.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Hindi po ito ganun ka-effective when it comes to enforcement aspect.” • “Sa enforcement aspect, ang issue dito is on how to empower the enforcement team para magkaroon ng immediate actions when it comes to environmental protection.” • “In terms of guarding [the ECAN], when it comes to enforcement and monitoring it is very weak.” • “Palawan is big, but enforcers are limited, less armed.” • Lack of coordination and protocols with other enforcement agencies. 		√		√
8	<p>Projects evaluation and monitoring.</p>			√	
9	<p>Implementation of ECAN at the LGU level. “Not all LGUs adopted the ECAN.”</p>				√
10	<p>Funding.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “PCSD lacks budget and people to implement its programs and activities.” 	√			√
11	<p>Lack of manpower/staff.</p>	√			
12	<p>Provision of alternative livelihood to IP communities whose traditional sources of livelihood (e.g. <i>kaingin</i>) have been declared illegal/regulated by the SEP Law.</p>			√	



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

RECOMMENDATIONS		FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academ e, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
1	<p>Improve information dissemination campaign and strategy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Educate the people, especially those in the Barangay Councils about the SEP Law.” • “An annual campaign must be conducted to promote the SEP law but it must be sold in manner that “makes the law matter to everyday life of the people.” • Conduct IEC activities in schools, universities. 	√		√	
2	<p>Capacitate, guide, assist LGUs.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Help us on the policy directions.” • “Guide the vice mayors, especially in formulating plans.” • “Assist LGUs.” • “<i>Dapat ang Sanguniang Bayan</i> has a copy of ECAN Maps.” • PCSD should always be present when LGUs formulate their respective Municipal Development Plans to guide the latter. • Capacitate LGUs on ECAN Zoning. 	√			
3	<p>Amend PCSD Composition.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Include representatives from the Philippine Councilors League and the Vice Mayors’ League. 	√			
4	<p>Amend composition of ECAN Boards and make their role clearer.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Get rid politicians in the Board, “<i>kasi napu-politika ang Board.</i>” • “<i>Hindi lahat nandoon</i> like the police, maritime, coast guard, <i>dapat isa lang at dapat walang</i> substitution in the representations.” • Composition of Tourism Councils may be considered as a model: 70% come from the private sector. • Clearly define the role of the Board. 	√			
5	<p>Harmonize PCSD’s functions with other agencies.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Level off with other NGAs since we don't agree with each other’s conflicting regulations. 	√			√



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

	<p>The processes imposed of other NGAs are conflicting.”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop joint enforcement protocols to improve law enforcement. 				
	RECOMMENDATIONS (continuation)	FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academ e, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
6	<p>The law allegedly does not include Kalayaan and the Calamianes in its territorial jurisdiction.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lobby in Congress to amend the law “due to [issue on the territorial jurisdiction indicated in the law].” 	√			
7	<p>Improve SEP Clearance/Permitting system.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Ensure that the Council meet once or twice a month to speed up decision-making.” “Clearance requirements should remain as is with the first issuance/conditions given.” If the law is amended, “exempt projects for the benefit of national security” from going through the “slow permitting system.” Permitting for academic researches and bioprospecting should be fast tracked and made flexible. “Simplify the permitting process for environmental researches.” “Amend the section in the law that sets very strict regulation for researchers.” 	√		√	√
8	<p>Improve Enforcement and Monitoring of Laws.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Add new enforcers. Add monitoring areas. Consider providing incentives/rewards, or improve the current scheme, to encourage more community reports of illegal activities on the ground. “Many informants disappear, risk their lives or are hostaged by violators.” “Confer with PNP, not only [when apprehending lumber cases, but on cases of <i>pawikan</i> smuggling] also.” Develop a joint enforcement protocol to facilitate the enforcement. “<i>Magkaroon</i> ng coordination, documentation of the present coordination to improve.” Increase funding for monitoring and enforcement activities. 			√	√



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

RECOMMENDATIONS (<i>continuation</i>)		FGD1: LGU (VML & PCL)	FGD2: LGU & Military	FGD3: Media, Academ e, NGOs	FGD4: NGAs, Police & Military
9	PCSD must coordinate with funding sources (provincial government, national government agencies) to increase funding for wildlife laws enforcement activities and for Protected Area management.				√
10	Make the penalties for violating the Wildlife Act (and other environmental laws) and the SEP Law steeper to effectively discourage violations. The current penalty is weak. <i>“Magpapakulong sila ng six months, bawi naman nila sa isang marine turtle na almost PhP 85,000.00 to PhP 150,000.00 bawat isa.”</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Integrate the provisions of the Wildlife Act in the SEP Law.” 				√
11	Improve/intensify compliance monitoring. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Formulate and consistently use monitoring matrix to regularly assess if the law is well-implemented. Use and pursue application of community-based ECAN Management Manual “which is a very good tool used in Mount Mantalingahan.” 			√	
12	“Amend [the law] partly in terms of mining and other major activities...look at allowing big industries, not only in terrestrial but also in coastal.”			√	
13	Use SEP and PCSD as “convergence zone” with other agencies in protected areas management, and other related activities.			√	

Annexes:

- Annex A: Quick Information about the FGDs
- Annex B: Briefer for FGD Participants
- Annex C: Guide Questions
- Annex D: Full documentation by FGD
- Annex E: Attendance Sheets



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development
Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

Annex A: Quick Information about the FGDs

SCHEDULE	SECTORS	TOTAL # OF PAX	MALE	FEMALE	DURATION
5-Mar-15	LGUs: Vice Mayors' League, Philippine Councilors' League	10	9	1	1:05PM - 2:16PM
6-Mar-15	LGUs & Enforcers (PCG, PNP & WesCom)	11	8	3	4:18PM - 4:30PM
14-Apr-14	Media, Academe & NGOs	6	1	5	10:00AM - 11:45AM
14-Apr-15	NGAs (DENR, BFAR), Police & Military	8	6	2	2:10PM - 4:20PM
TOTAL		35	24	11	
% TO TOTAL PAX			68.57%	31.43%	

Facilitator for FGDs 1 & 2: James Paul S. Inawasan
Facilitator for FGDs 3 & 4: Engr. Madrono Cabrestante, Jr.

Documentors:
 Jenevieve P. Hara
 Marianne Faith Perez
 Cherry Lyn S. Jalover
 Luigi Lubrico

Lead Documentor: James Paul S. Inawasan

For questions, comments, feedback and suggestions regarding this Report, kindly e-mail:
james.inawasan@yahoo.com and mcabrestante@yahoo.com with the subject line “SEP Workshops Documentation”.



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

Annex B: Briefer for FGD Participants.

SEP Law: Its Impacts to Palawan, Its Environment, People and Development

A review and assessment of the Law
through Focus Group Discussions with
Key Stakeholders

Slide 1

- Various stakeholders all over Palawan will be invited to participate to a series of FGDs;
- Results of the FGD will be compiled, analyzed, synthesized;
- Results will be forwarded to the PCSD management (Council and leadership) for appropriate action (amendment of law and/or organizational improvement);

Slide 3

Background of the FGD

- Republic Act 7611 or the Strategic Environment Plan for Palawan Act is 23 years old this year.
- The PCSDS, the administrative machinery vested with the power to implement the RA, would like to know/assess from its stakeholders:
 - how the law was implemented in the past years;
 - what are its achievements, failures, areas for improvement;
 - how the law and its implementation can be improved.

Slide 2

- Openly, freely share opinions and thoughts but please be straight to the point to give ample time to other pax.
- Communication traffic.
 - Listen while other pax are still speaking.
 - Let other pax speak/share.
- Specific recommendations and suggestions are appreciated.
- Thank you very much for your time and honesty.

Slide 4



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

Annex C: Guide Questions

1. To establish participants' profile: How many years have you been working in your post/sector?
 - 1.1. In your respective [sector / locality / constituency], are people aware about the existence of the SEP Law?
 - 1.2. The PCSD?
 - 1.3. In general, how do they *feel* about it? How do you *feel* about it?
 - 1.4. What do you *think* about the SEP Law?
2. In your opinion, what do you think has been achieved by the SEP Law? *Please cite specific achievements or gains courtesy of the law – for Palawan, its environment, people and over-all development.*
 - 2.1. Has the law worked well for your sector/local government/community?
 - 2.2. Can you cite examples of instances or experiences where you think the SEP Law has worked for you?
3. How about its failures, or areas for improvement?
 - 3.1. Any specific areas where the law and/or its implementation needs to improve on? *Please cite examples when the SEP Law has become a constraint to your sector/local government/community.*
4. Is there a need to update the law, amend it, or improve it?
 - 4.1. What specific changes do you propose?
5. Looking at the SEP Law vis-à-vis Palawan's development in the last 23 years, has the SEP Law worked well for the Province?
 - 5.1. For the environment?
 - 5.2. For its people?
6. Without the SEP Law, where do you think would Palawan be now?
7. Over-all, is the SEP Law okay/good to you or not?



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

Annex D: Documentation by FGD¹

FGD Group Number: 1
 Group/Sector: LGU (Vice Mayors' League, Philippine Councilors League)
 Number of Participants: 10 Male: 9 Female: 1
 Date: March 5, 2015 Venue: PCSD Conference Room, 3rd floor, PCSD Building, Sta. Monica Heights, PPC

QUESTIONS	RESPONSES/REMARKS
<p>1. To establish participants' profile: How many years have you been working in your post/sector?</p> <p>In your respective [sector / locality / constituency], are people aware about the existence of the SEP Law? The PCSD?</p> <p>In general, how do they <i>feel</i> about it? How do you <i>feel</i> about it?</p> <p>What do you <i>think</i> about the SEP Law?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are familiar individuals to PCSD, but only few in Barangay level are aware of the law governing it (SEP). In general, most of the time ay nagkakaroon sila ng idea about SEP Law if PCSD invoke the law and their authority such as Chainsaw Act or kapag ang monitoring team ay nakakapunta sa lugar. The local people who never had transaction with PCSD weren't aware, they know the PCSD but not the SEP, only those proponents or traders na nakakaalam ng law and who had direct transactions with PCSD. We are the first LGU with ECAN board established. • In the protection of the environment and corresponding responsibilities, ang unang pumapasok sa utak natin ay PCSD, I would like to answer that in the level of Sanguniang Bayan they are aware, municipal level highly aware but the Barangay officials are not kaya dapat na mabigyan sila ng awareness. • We are proud that Palawan has a special law. But the problem is duplication of functions. Others are questioning if PCSD duplicates the power of DENR, BFAR and other agencies, we wonder what the real objective is. But so far, the PCSD is there not to give us mandatory or confiscatory actions or etc., but a policy making body focused on giving us directions. PCSD as the highest body on environmental concerns in Palawan, PCSD also as venue of political biases, kaya nawawala ang true essence. There was once that one document was approved without passing through ng SEP process, Diwaran Island is an example, dapat dadaan sa proseso, no shortcuts, these are examples, that if it is the law, it should not be selective, the law is very noble pero the people who are handling it can sometimes be considered as the problem. Now the

¹ Consolidated documentation by Ms. Jenevieve Hara. Names of FGD participants who expressed the opinions contained herein were intentionally omitted by the lead documentor.



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

	<p>PCSD involves everyone, tulad ngayon, bihira ito mangyari noong araw, this is the first time that the Vice Mayors League is invited in this forum.</p>
<p>2. In your opinion, what do you think has been achieved by the SEP Law? <i>(Please cite specific achievements or gains courtesy of the law – for Palawan, its environment, people and over-all development)</i> Has the law worked well for your sector/local government/community? Can you cite examples of instances or experiences where you think the SEP Law has worked for you?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I felt na nakakatulong talaga ang SEP law like for example in regulation of livefish, ang mga tao ay hindi natatakot sa Local Government Unit (LGU) pero sa PCSD takot sila. We are then requesting the PCSD to help us on the policy directions, to guide the vice mayors, especially in formulating plans because this is the mandate of PCSD, to assist LGUs, dapat ang Sanguniang Bayan has a copy of ECAN Maps. In general, like the presence of DMO Coron, nakikita namin na it should work focusing to the mandate of PCSD. • We believe that SEP has big participation especially on the livefish trading. In our area, we are near Malaysia, some people are doing illegal activities, illegal cutting of trees, illegal fishing, some of them ay binabalewala lang ang LGU, hindi nila kinakatakutan unlike to PCSD na talagang kinakatakutan nila dahil maaari silang kasuhan. May lantsa na na-confiscate ang PCSD.
<p>3. How about its failures, or areas for improvement? Any specific areas where the law and/or its implementation needs to improve on? <i>Please cite examples when the SEP Law has become a constraint to your sector/local government/community.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Failures include lack of budget or financial capability of PCSD to implement its projects, plans and programs, given the chance na maging bigger ang funds, then it would be better, I think mas madami at malaki ang magagawa. • Additional manpower, dahil kulang ang staff ng PCSD na nagmo-monitor like in our place at Cagayancillo. • It's better to get rid of politicians as member of ECAN Board, kasi napu-politika ang board. Kasi kapag private sector, subjective ang pag-review. • Researches about our coral reef, kelan pa ba magkaron ng CRM ulit samin sa Cuyo, sana po magkaroon ng survey para malaman talaga ang real time status ng resources natin. Sa result ay zero ang percentage ng coral reef namin, di ako naniniwala may two protected areas, meron sa Amanpulo, sana kahit sa 5% man lang ay matatanggap ko na. Sana madagdagan din pati manpower para sa enforcement sa Cuyo, Agutaya at Magsaysay, dahil ang tao ng PCSD ay dadalawa lang, dapat madagdagan dahil sa laki ng lugar na sakop. • Iyong about sa duplication of functions, there must be a complementation with other government agencies, para di masayang iyong efforts, time and resources. Strategic approach dapat, walang duplication, if there



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

	<p>are conflicting dapat i-harmonize, para iyong di nagagawa ng ibang department ay nagagawa ng PCSD. Like the geo- hazard survey, we expect PCSD to provide us as part of the ECAN Zoning; we can use this as the basis in the decision making. So we can contribute/provide materials na tatabahuin ng legislators. We trust PCSD, so we believe them, we are not duplicating but we are doing what are required in Palawan, wala namang Palaweño na gusto masira ang Palawan. Sana magkaroon ng study on alternative livelihood for example kung ano ang resources na available sa isang area na pwedi ipalit sa suno. Para alam din namin kung ano talaga ang susundin, ECAN map o CLUP map, who will prevail, the best way that you can do here is dun sa pag-develop ng Municipal Development Plan, dapat present lagi ang PCSD para may guidance.</p>
<p>4. Is there a need to update the law, amend it, or improve it?</p> <p>What specific changes do you propose?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lobby to congress to amend the law, due to lack of territorial jurisdiction. What the law does not include, it excludes kasi excluded kami sa SEP coverage ng PCSD. We have here three congressmen to help in lobbying. Kasi if there is a test case, baka ma-dismiss ang case ng PCSD due to lack of jurisdiction. • Councilors and vice mayors league representation sa council, since they represent the issues in the municipal level, kasi tumatalakay kami ng batas. • Composition of ECAN Board, dapat mag-strategize, clearly defined dapat kung ano ba talaga ang role. Dapat sa ECAN Board hindi lahat nadoon like police, maritime, coast guard, dapat isa lang at dapat walang substitution in the representations. Since the decisions would vary with respect to the person present in the meeting, in terms of percentage di natin pweding diktahan pero like sa tourism council ay 70 % ay from private sector.
<p>5. Looking at the SEP Law vis-à-vis Palawan's development in the last 23 years, has the SEP Law worked well for the Province?</p> <p>For the environment?</p> <p>For its people?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes nakakatulong, dahil kung hindi ay kalbo na ang gubat. • Sa development, painstaking talaga ang process. Hindi investor friendly ang PCSD. 'Pacuri kamo sa development', (Cuyunon word). The objective of the law is good but it depends and matters most on how you implement it...yung SEP law reminds us na hindi lang yan para sa government kundi sa ating lahat. • Resort investors in Calamianes said na sobrang mahaba ang process ng pag-apply, that's why they think na parusa iyon sa kanila, pero ngayon nakikita ko po na nagiging aware na iyong mga investors to protect marine resources kasi iyon ang main source of their activities in the area. They are now helping in the protection of the environment.



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nararamdaman ng tao, lalo na kapag implemented na ang revised, AO 5 and 6, mararamdaman nila kapag wala na silang makain, ramdam in a negative way. • Ramdam talaga kaya dapat ready napo ang mga alternative livelihood parasamga fisherman dahil kagayasa aminsa Cuyo more than 50% ang fisherman..paki steady, standby and ready posanaang livelihood programs. • Number one livelihood namin is catching of suno din. Ang impact nito sa mga tao samin is kung paano maexplain na mgkaroon ng alternative livelihood, my suggestion is baka possible na ang PCSD ay magpunta doon sa area to explain sa mga tao at para maintindihan nila.
<p>6. Without the SEP Law, where do you think would Palawan be now?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Without SEP law kalbo na ang bundok, wala na ding isda pero pagdating sa development ay mahirapa talaga. • If wala ang SEP marami na ang mga hotel and resorts..kung wala ang SEP law nasaan na ang Palawan.. it is not the SEP law per se that protects Palawan, it is the Palawan people that protects but the SEP is the one that serves as guide and create guidelines to Palawan people in protecting the environment.SEP law triggered the consciousness of people in environmental awareness. Long processes as constraints, finances are not the issue, it is more on the long process, they don't have issues on the amount they paid in securing clearances, it's not about money, it's about the process they have to undergo before they can start their business.
<p>7. Over-all, is the SEP Law okay/good to you or not?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Weighing all these, the SEP law is a good law and I am sure that PCSDS are really doing their job, it is unfair to them na sabihing hindi dahil ang totoo ay ginagawa nila but meron silang mga bosses na nagi-stir sa kanila, I'm referring to the Council, dahil wala silang choice kung saansila gustong papuntahin ng council,na umiiba ang directions and in every three years ay pinapalitan din. • VM Tan of Cuyo: Ok ang SEP Law, like in us in LGUs, ang PCSD ay di kayang takutin ng mga tao dahil hindi binubuto kaya na i-enforce ang dapat i-enforce, with SEP, law are enforced accordingly.

Facilitator:

James Paul S. Inawasan

Duration: 1:05PM-2:16PM

Documentors:

Jenevieve P. Hara, Cherry Lyn S. Jalover, Marianne Faith M. Perez



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

FGD Group Number: 2
 Group/Sector: LGU (PCL, LCE's representatives), Philippine Coastguard, PNP and Western Command
 Number of Participants: 11 Male: 8 Female: 3
 Date: March 6, 2015 Venue: PCSD Conference Room, 3rd floor, PCSD Building, Sta. Monica Heights, PPC

QUESTIONS	RESPONSES/REMARKS
<p>2. In your opinion, what do you think has been achieved by the SEP Law? <i>(Please cite specific achievements or gains courtesy of the law – for Palawan, its environment, people and over-all development)</i></p> <p>Has the law worked well for your sector/local government/community? Can you cite examples of instances or experiences where you think the SEP Law has worked for you?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I think SEP Law is a good program/plan in Palawan. • So far based on my observation, maganda ang nagawa nito when it comes to environmental protection kasi every LGU ay nagkaroon ng guidelines in every municipality. • Maganda iyong framework, yung mga ideas, im not so familiar with regards to paano naging effective, pero ang alam lang nating lahat ay hindi po ito ganun ka-effective when it comes to enforcement aspect. About sa ECAN board isa ito sa mga move to make this law be attentive but again makikita natin yan in the future if effective, masasabi ko lang talaga na the concept is really good. • Sa amin ay malaki ang nagagawa sa aming munisipyo ng ECAN Board dahil ang composition ay from LGU at guided naman kami. • Syempre naman po dahil sa amin din sa El Nido ay palaging present ang representative ng PCSD na si Sir Raul Maximo who is always guiding us when it comes to decision making. • About sa fishing, iyong mga isda ay lumalapit ulit, dahil dati malayo pa ang nararating ng mga fisherman, ngayon e di na sila masyadong lumalayo, sa tingin ko e isa ito sa epekto ng mga efforts ng PCSD.
<p>3. How about its failures, or areas for improvement? Any specific areas where the law and/or its implementation needs to improve on?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sa enforcement aspect, ang issue dito is on how to empower the enforcement team para magkaroon ng immediate actions when it comes to environmental protection.



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

<i>Please cite examples when the SEP Law has become a constraint to your sector/local government/community.</i>	
4. Is there a need to update the law, amend it, or improve it? What specific changes do you propose?	
5. Looking at the SEP Law vis-à-vis Palawan's development in the last 23 years, has the SEP Law worked well for the Province? For the environment? For its people?	
6. Without the SEP Law, where do you think would Palawan be now?	
7. Over-all, is the SEP Law okay/good to you or not?	

Note: The participants expressed that they have not reviewed the law, and are newly-assigned in Palawan, in the case of enforcers. Most of the invited participants, supposedly from the Philippine Councilors League, did not arrive; the participants in this group were at PCSD Office for another meeting but was requested for an FGD to maximize the opportunity of having the top officials of the Military and the PNP of the province in one venue.

Facilitator:

James Paul S. Inawasan

Duration: 4:18PM-4:30PM

Documentors:

Jenevieve P. Hara, Luigi Lubrico



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

FGD Group Number: 3
 Group/Sector: Media, Academe and NGO
 Number of Participants: 6 Male: 1 Female: 5
 Date: April 14, 2015 Venue: PCSD Conference Room, 3rd floor, PCSD Building, Sta. Monica Heights, PPC

QUESTIONS	RESPONSES/REMARKS
<p>2. In your opinion, what do you think has been achieved by the SEP Law? <i>(Please cite specific achievements or gains courtesy of the law – for Palawan, its environment, people and over-all development)</i></p> <p>Has the law worked well for your sector/local government/community? Can you cite examples of instances or experiences where you think the SEP Law has worked for you?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tinitingnan ko kasi ang mga objectives ng SEP kasi kami hindi din familiar sa mga objectives na iyon kung naa-attain ba iyon and if have we addressed the objectives in 23 years? Background should be given since we are not really familiar with the achievements and the targets of the PCSD kasi po kami ay may mga observations based on our own experiences, siguro mas maganda na iemail nalang ito sa nakararami para malaman natin yung mga reactions ng mga nakararami and to obtain several ideas from other faculty. • We all have to review the SEP law, how can we check, we cannot comment (no idea), dito nagiging specific talaga, masasagot yan ng media, bakit di nagiging effective? Ano yung approach nyo masyado bang high profile masyado pong mataas ang approach nyo, high profile ang PCSD, dapat bumaba ang approach ng PCSD, para mas maintindihan ng mga tao kahit na si Ate na nandoon sa bundok at nagdadamo, ay maintindihan at makukuha ang idea, not effective kasi ‘walang landi’ ang dating sa tao, iyong primer English, walang subject requiring the SEP sa mga schools and universities, not being utilized in the class since it’s not oblige to do so. Dapat may yearly campaign, to include the SEP in the lifestyle at not all just ‘bawal’, dapat meron ding because of it naging healthy kami, yumaman kami. • Marami nga ang nagbibigay ng primer, kaso parang halos English naman lahat, naba-browse ko sya pero kasi halimbawa sa mga university nyan po hindi na-tatackle, kaya siguro po maganda may mga activity tayo sa bawat universities para malaman nila yung mga testimonies ng epekto nito, lumago kami, nagiging healthy kami, o umayos ang buhay namin, para mas malaman ng marami ang effect nito.



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

3. How about its failures, or areas for improvement?

Any specific areas where the law and/or its implementation needs to improve on?

Please cite examples when the SEP Law has become a constraint to your sector/local government/community.

4. Is there a need to update the law, amend it, or improve it?

What specific changes do you propose?

5. Looking at the SEP Law vis-à-vis Palawan's development in the last 23 years, has the SEP Law worked well for the Province?

For the environment?

For its people?

- Magandang katanungan para mapaganda ang SEP, kunti ang kaalaman ko dito, dahil bago ako sa ELAC, dadalhin ko ito sa amin para mas madaming makuhang information, ang masasabi ko lang maganda naman sana talaga ang batas kung ito ay naipapatupad ng maayos, para malaman kung paano nagiging effective siguro dapat nating tingan at magkaroon ng assessment in the community level kung napapatupad ng maayos, sa staff level naman dapat i-assess din iyong effectiveness, kung naipapatupad ng mga staff ang bawat aspeto ng batas kasi mayroon po tayong minsang aspeto na magaling na minsan naman naiisantabi, kagaya ng sa wildlife, ok kayo dyan pero halimbawa when it comes to monitoring of projects and evaluation, tingnan kung ito ba ay napapatupad, intensify the compliance monitoring.
- Mas maganda na may duration or expiration iyong SEP clearance depende sa project para ma monitor thru renewal.
- Siguro po 3 to 5 years.
- Gumawa ng survey o research regarding your impacts, marami na po kayong nakatrabaho e, siguro po may survey questionnaires po kayo tapos kayo dito sa PCSD Staff ang dapat na unang sasagot dun kasi kayo po ang nagpapatupad then iyong mga kumukuha ng permits, at mga PENRO/CENROs yun pong may mga direct experiences ang maganda pong matanong din like LGUs, IPs, NGOs, universities, industries and other stakeholders, base po sa sections ng SEP law. Tingnan po natin bawat projects, kahit questionnaire lang po, masasagot po yun, actually in terms of accomplishments, PCSD po ang talagang nakakaalam dahil kayo po ang nagiimplement.
- Iyong totoo lang, ilagay talaga ang mga recommendations ng tao, siguro po dapat pag nag-implement ay kontra partidos, at dapat din tanungin sa interview hindi friends pag-dating sa monitoring, actually timing po, magandang dissertations po ang topic na ito. Isa pa Jong, iyong sa academe, mayroon silang mga studies na ginawa na tina-tackle doon ung SEP sa mga studies, dapat aware tayong doon siguro dapat i-collate yun.
- After so many years nga po napansin din namin iyong process of securing of permit, 1 year, but 6 months are devoted to permitting. Index review committee, lalo na kapag yung study is sakop ng law. Are we looking at ibang provision ng law? Permitting for academic researches should be fast



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

tracked, bio prospecting also.

- Researchers are now required to secure permits. I'm very thankful that when I applied for permit, it was very fast. because in my case kagaya nung sa dissertation o sa pagkuha ng permt ay naibigay naman I have no personal experience against the SEP. For me may mga positive tlaqa, marami syang mga magandang nagawa ang law sa Palawan, yung mga officemate ko po yung study nila is yung ginawa nya para di pakiaalaman na mga kiyaw ay binigyan ng kambing para di na galawin ang mga resources (Jun Bernardo). Siguro iyong sa requirement para sa SEP clearance for the academe na dapat maging flexible, kasi kami ay di naman kumukuha ng maramihan na sample. Maraming species sa Palawan na mga foreigner ang mga naka-discover, na hindi natin alam, maraming taga Palawan ang gusto gawin pero di magawa dahil sa permitting, dahil halimbawa sa studyante, may time bounded sila. May naitulong, but we have to really review and look into the law deeper.
- Nakatulong ba ang researches sa plan formulation?
- Yes, like sa Turtle Bay and Camia Bay, 20 years na yang marine protected area kuno, we conducted survey doon, the results were used by the City to revise the declaration on the area.
- Nagiging major constraints when it comes to environmental research, dahil sa permitting, ay hindi makagawa ng taxonomic studies para mkadiscovers ng bago species. Transfer herbarium, needs a lot of permits. Actually, sa permit, natatambay kami sa NCIP, di kami nakakarating sa inyo. I-amend ang section ng batas na mahigpit sa researchers. Kapag may study po on impact it will become as a hard evidence po kapag may mga i-amend.
- Fast tracking, simplify the permitting process for environmental researches.
- Simplify the law.. 'Laymanize the law' para hindi maging hi-end, yung kahit na common na tao e maiintindihan ito..Iyong sa primer, pweding comic's para sa information dissemination.
- Sa aming pananaw, maraming natulong ang batas, maganda yung batas kung nasusunod talaga sya, posibleng kung walang SEP law baka ang bundok natin ay butas butas na, malaking tulong talga, dahil kung wala e baka puro kaingin na ang mga bundok. Marami ang tumatawag sa amin at reklamo dahil meron batas na ngbabawal sa mga pagkakaingin. Ang isang tinitingnan natin dyan



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

kagaya ng sa mga katutubo na dapat binibigyan natin ng alternative livelihood, may suporta na matulungan nama-improve ang kanilang mga skills, at turuan natin kung paano isu-sustain, bigyan ng support na isusustain nila, nakakatulong sya sa tao, indirectly, halimbawa if masira ang bundok e di wala ng tubig at pangkalahatan.

- In general na nakikita, yung law kasi kung sino ang boss sya nagi-implement, pagdating sa implementation, di naman kami anti, nakikita lang natin na tayo ang nag-i-implement pero di din nasusunod ang nakalagay batas. Sana ay hanggang RTN lamang. Sa controlled used zone, landsat, tulad ng underground, controlled used zone but madaming buhay ilang ang makikita. Ang mga minerals ay nasa controlled, titingnan din siguro natin, halimbawa sa project, if has opportunity, personally kelangan i-amend in terms of mining and other major activities, to amend, partly ay sa pag allow ng big industries, not only in terrestrial but also in coastal. Given na sinasabing last frontier, sayang yung sep law, dahil hindi nakikita sa dami ng development na di natin kayang bantayan at i-monitor at kung pati na yung marginalized ay sobrang affected na din.
- From the outside laging tinitingnan ang Palawan as model because of SEP, but from inside, hindi naman natutugunan ng SEP law kasi nakikita ko in the ground, wala tayong batayan dahil wala tayong monitoring matrix na dapat na batayan natin bago masabi nating nakatulong nga ang SEP sa mga tao, how do we bring the result ng mga mino-monitror natin, kung di naman nakakarating sa tao na apektado. Walang bula po magagaling ang staff, well-equipped pero pagdating sa council parang nabubura po yun, dahil sa mga decisions, specific na example, Macro asia MPSA, it takes so long before we can decide/tell to Macro asia that they cannot work on core zone, at may batas like NIPAS, bkit andaming taon na ang Macro asia ay nag-i-exist pa rin, it is the very specific example na di madesisyunan using the law, dapat meron ng matrix, para quantitative yung alam nating effect, sigro tingnan on how to integrate to other laws, such iPRA, NIPAS, with the ECAN as basic framework at for consolidation at consistencies, sa ngayon po ba mayroon na tayong tribal ancestral zones, with CADT or CADC ng NCIP, natutulungan ba natin sila? Like until now they are paying too much to extract forest products (to DENR) it's difficult to say na di natin ma-define, sana dapat mag-evolve ang SEP based on lessons learned from the past years. How many PAs do we have, bound with core zone. Help the other government agencies since we have big core zones within



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

	<p>these PAs. If we cannot implement for the entire province, we can start with PAs management, like protected areas sana magamit ang SEP at PCSD as convergence zone with other agencies. Paano ang synergy, sana mahawa ang DENR /other agencies. There is continuing staff development unlike in other GAs. Sana mgkaroon ng convergence. Paano nakatulong? Community based ECAN management manual, it is a good tool we did use that in Mount Mantalingahan, sana ma-pursue at magamit naman to the effect sa ibang parte ng Palawan, it was good tool, that's why we know that Macro asia ay nasa core zone at sana yung compliance monitoring ay ma-enhance, na kapag core zones, core zone.</p>
6. Without the SEP Law, where do you think would Palawan be now?	
7. Over-all, is the SEP Law okay/good to you or not?	

Facilitator:

Engr. Madrono P. Cabrestante, Jr.

Duration: 10:00AM-11:45AM

Documentors:

Jenevieve P. Hara

Marianne Faith M. Perez



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

FGD Group Number: 4
 Group/Sector: NGA's, Police and Military, PA, CENRO
 Number of Participants: 8 Male: 6 Female: 2
 Date: April 14, 2015 Venue: PCSD Conference Room, 3rd floor, PCSD Building, Sta. Monica Heights, PPC

QUESTIONS	RESPONSES/REMARKS
<p>2. In your opinion, what do you think has been achieved by the SEP Law? <i>(Please cite specific achievements or gains courtesy of the law – for Palawan, its environment, people and over-all development)</i></p> <p>Has the law worked well for your sector/local government/community? Can you cite examples of instances or experiences where you think the SEP Law has worked for you?</p> <p>3. How about its failures, or areas for improvement?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ECANization, but not all LGUs adopted the ECAN. • Now, we are more into on how to apply for marine protected area. How do we apply for an MPA in an area, such as in Ulugan bay, since we have Head Quarter in Ulugan Bay. There are areas we plan to develop as MPAs ~ what are the major requirements? What else to be done so that we can start the operations this year? On the other part, honestly matagal ang process because hindi nagko-convene lagi ang council, hindi nagkakarron ng resolutions at SEP clearance kaya yun di din kami nabibigyan ng ECC from DENR, SEP is a prerequisite to the ECC. The whole process is all affected because of that, ang mga contractor's meron silang hinahabol na schedule, kawawa naman sila dahil hind pwedi mag-start kapag wala pa silang permit from PCSD. Activities are connecting, naapektuhan din iyong iba, the projects in Bahile for our detachment, 2012 pa. What do we recommend? I'm not familiar with the process of clearance, at least set the council to have a meeting once or twice a month, and have the set of requirements na fixed, yun lang po ang naghohold, kaya di matapos tapos ang project namin. • Kulang, malinaw dapat sa mga magpo-put up ng projects ang procedures at requirements. It's the PCSD responsibilities that the contractors are not knowledgeable about PCSD requirement/SEP system. Then the DENR gets the blame for not issuing the ECC due to non issuance of SEP clearance. Kelangan talagang magkaroon ng leveling off of agencies and convening of council. • Level off with other NGAs since we don't agree with each other's conflicting regulations. The



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

<p>Any specific areas where the law and/or its implementation needs to improve on?</p> <p><i>Please cite examples when the SEP Law has become a constraint to your sector/local government/community.</i></p> <p>4. Is there a need to update the law, amend it, or improve it?</p> <p>What specific changes do you propose?</p> <p>5. Looking at the SEP Law vis-à-vis Palawan's development in the last 23 years, has the SEP Law worked well for the Province?</p> <p>For the environment?</p> <p>For its people?</p> <p>6. Without the SEP Law, where do you think would Palawan be now?</p> <p>7. Over-all, is the SEP Law okay/good to you or not?</p>	<p>processes imposed of other NGAs are conflicting. The 3rd party hired by naval forces west, not yet done and here comes additional conditions, but there are new requirements added to the conditions (detachments, 2012). Requirements should remain as is with the first issuance/conditions given. To date, permanent injunction - road project to Bahile/Ulugan. We can recommend/lobby but we want to go through the process/requirements of the project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• In Quezon, we encountered problems (municipal police station project), because of the requirements for SEP, the contractor's operations were delayed natagalan and because of the required permits for the cutting of trees kaya naapektuhan ang project sa Quezon, iyong sa Rizal di kumuha ng permit kaya mas nauna silang matapos.• One of the other issues po is yung duplication of requirements, kinuha na sa una, sa susunod kukunin ulit, nagiging paulit ulit po e.• Kayo dapat na magkaroon ng levelling off of requirements within agencies.• The system in Palawan is not the same with other provinces kaya po lets make it better and efficient na.• Bahile boat tram project, base on the site description po kasi may 9 mangrove trees po doon na dapat putulin, we've conducted two public consultations within the Barangay at tanggap naman ng community. This project is US government funded, but now I think ipo-full up na yung project dahil sa sobrang tagal ng process, sayang nga po ang project. Nag-decline ang contractor dahil matagal na hindi kame makakuha ng SEP clearance dahil sa 9 mangrove trees.• Magsulat ang sa higher level, dahil wala sa level ng authority ng CENRO.• So, sa amendment of law, siguro lagyan po ng exemption halimbawa po e kapag projects for the benefit of national security baka pweding maisama po.• Taking into consideration that Palawan is wide, PNP focused on the peace and order, but when we travel by air there are lot of violations. I think in terms of strategic plan with the land use, maganda po, ECAN is good, but in terms of guarding it, when it comes to enforcement and monitoring it is very weak. I'm not saying po na not effective ang enforcement ng PCSDS, nakakasama ko si Nino, nakikita ko rin po ang ginagawa nila at na kunti po talaga ang Enforcers. Palawan is big, but
--	---



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

enforcers are limited, less armed. Environmental Enforcement committee /teams or partners LGUs are not active. So, it is recommended to add new enforcers and add monitoring areas, maganda if ma-amend man po ang batas baka pweding lagyan ng provision about sa reward system para makatulong sa monitoring at para po sa mga informants dahil buhay ang katapat, dapat may reward para ma-relocate nya ang pamilya kapag nagsumbong sya. There must be an access to funds of the provincial government for enforcement. To improve the management of PAs, enforcement should be strengthened. Confer with PNP, not only lumber, but on the smuggling of pawikan also.

- Possible part ng reward, is halimbawa incentives po para dun sa informant, malaking tulong po kasi ito like nung experience sa Balabac, may case po dun na may informant na ngayon ay ayaw na I turn over yung alam nya dahil na rin sa threat at dahil na din hanggang ngayon po ata ay di pa din nabibigay ng eward nya na dapat dati pa.
- On the part of the PNP, we are willing to give support but the limitation is the fund, SEP can order to other agencies, kaya nyang manduhan ang ibang agency.
- Most of the part of Palawan is protected area, each of it has enforcement committee which is multi-sectoral with the membership of PNP, PCG, Philippine Navy, so ganoon po total ang PCSD naman ay pweding manduhan ang ibang agency dahil you are powerful here in Palawan, so dapat mas palakasin natin ang ating enforcement lalo na sa area ng bawat PAs o kaya magkaroon ng sharing of resources para mapalakas ang enforcement,
- Malaking tulong po ang PCSD samin kasi doon sa mga lugar na may tao kami o kaya limited ang tao e nagkakaroon po ang PCSD at BFAR ng tie-up in implementing of regulations, pero may mga conflict din po na nangyayari na halimbawa may species na samin di pingbabawal ng BFAR pero sa PCSD naman ay bawal kaya kelangan po magkaroon ng leveling off, minsan naman po may instances na may permit na sa PCSD pero dahil nire-require pa namin ang CDT results kaya kami ang nasisisi, minsan naman sa inyo approved na samin di pa, auxillary invoice samin halimbawa sa inyo naman local transport permit, so yun nagkakaroon na kaisipan na namamahalan sila sa mga babayaran, nirereklamo nila na mataas daw ang binabayaran. Sinasabi lang na dahil may special law sa Palawan kaya iba rin ang pamantayan. Marami ang process and ang requirements na nagging pahirap sa mga shippers. Sa law enforcement, meron kaming order pero nawawala na ang aming



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

informant dahil hawak na daw ng target ang aming asset at papatayin daw sila pag kami ay pumasok, kawawa po talaga ang ating mga impormante kaya dapat na magkaroon ng incentives ang mga kumo-cooperate satin when it comes to enforcement.

- Reward system: Nawawala ang informant at ginagawang hostage ng mga violators, kaya talagang kawawa sila, malakas ang intel ng violators. Pawikan issues, di natatakot ang mga poachers dahil napakababa lang ng parusa, (RA 9147 or Wildlife act/ RA 8550) tapos iyong 6 months na kulong e magpapakulong nalang sila dahil bawi naman sila sa kikitán nila na almost 85K -150k for 1 marine turtle, that's why violators would rather do the same violations again. Severe sanctions to the law violators (20 years na kulong). Scarce ang bentahan dahil sa effective na law enforcement, actually kapag may gun boat, for sure isang buwan na gutom din ang tao sa Balabac. It is not included in SEP law, so we need to integrate the provisions on wildlife and 8550. Yes, ipasok natin ang issues na to sa amendment ng law, na kung pwedi taasan ang parusa on this issue. Mandami ang nakakalusot na persecuted, kaya dapat i-update ang batas.
- Madaming elements/ madami ang butas at nakakalusot, I think maybe kelangan iupdate ang batas, check in balance para maging mas maayos ang implementation.
- Higher/severe penalties of violations, for example sa Singapore, sa ibang bansa natatakot ang mga tao to do illegal activities because malalaki ang mga penalties.
- However, the enforcers have limited knowledge, at least kapag may legal aspect of the apprehensions napakalaki ng tulong on how we go on with the prosecution, ang problem namin is on enforcement, have a enforcement protocol, develop a joint enforcement protocol to facilitate the enforcement. The national is working on it, but Palawan can develop the same po para halimbawa napadaan ang barko namin tapos may alam na may nangyayari doon, e magagawa na huliin and then thru it alam namin kung san na dadalhin. Magkaroon ng coordination, documentation of the present coordination to improve.
- To be honest, iyong 1st exposure ko is with Niño, wala akong masasabi, talagang ang problema lang natin siguro dapat magkaroon pa ng mas closer and focused coordination pa, kasi siguro kulang tayo sa push when it comes to enforcement. Within 5 years of being here, ay madaming nagbago sa Palawan, kapag nagtuloy-tuloy ay malamang magiging sira na ang Palawan. Sa PNP, actually



Palawan Council for Sustainable Development

Puerto Princesa City, Palawan

makikita naman natin na tuloy tuloy pa din iyong paggawa ng mga furniture, finished forest products / lumber kahit sinasabi na naka-ban na. Walang statistics on how much kahoy ang talagang kailangan natin. We developed SD for Palawan, ano ngayon ng definiton of SD? Tinanggal na din ang deputization.

- Marami pong operation, dahil hindi kami deputize, hindi din namin magawa dahil halimbawa wala kaming joint operation, di magawa hanggat wala kaming kasama na from your office, agency protocols again should be developed. Joint operations so that anyone can attest during hearing later on. Kaya less iyong participation of other agencies dahil walang incentives at minsan own expense pa namin, must have support to the witnesses during hearing, as per apprehension report of this and that unit, kapag may protocol mas napapadali halimbawa kapag may operation at may proper documentation pwedi namin itransfer sa PCSD iyong application ng case.
- Oo namn, 30 years na ako dito, kung titingnan natin noong mga panahong 1980s wala pang SEP law ay nakalakaas ng kaingin dito, Although wala tayong statistics, pero makikita natin na rampant talaga but noong nagkaroon ng SEP, unti unting nabawasan, malaking bagay na din kasi nagkaroon sila ng takot, dahil noon parang walang takot yung mga illegalista. Isang bagay po iyon na epekto ng SEP yung mabawasan unti unti ung kaingin, because slash and burn is a strong threat to the forest protection. Sa development naman e di masyado, isa sa pinakamagandang outcome po is yung creation of ECAN board dahil in the local level ay ngsama sama ang mga ibat ibang agencies at napag-uusapan ang issues, in terms of the environment, maganda ang presence nga pcsds sa multi-partite monitoring team, may mino-monitor na magkasama tayo halimbawa sa Kaliksi Resort, pawikan hatchery permit for Kaliksi was recommended.
- Sa protected area management maganda ang outcome ng SEP dahil sa pagkakaroon ng complementation on the implementation of PA management.

Facilitator: Engr. Madrono P. Cabrestante

Documentors: Jenevieve P. Hara, Marriane Faith M. Perez

Duration: 2:10PM-4:20PM

ⁱ Mineral Production Sharing Agreement.

ⁱⁱ National Commission on Indigenous Peoples.